SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

REPORT TO:	Development and Conservation Control Committee	1 st September 2004
AUTHOR/S:	Director of Development Services	

S/1297/04/LB & S/1298/04/F - Linton S/1297/04/LB - Alterations – Replacement of Beam and Strengthening of Wall in Basement of Stair Tower and Construction of Brick Extension for Porch and Shower Room. New Dwarf Wall and Steps.

S/1298/04/F - Extension at Emsons Farmhouse, 18 Bartlow Road for Mr and Mrs Reimann

Recommendation: Refusal

Members will visit the site on Tuesday 31st August 2004

Site and Proposal

- 1. These applications, submitted on the 24th June 2004, seek consent for the erection of a single storey, pitched roof extension on the rear of the building to form a porch and shower room, adjacent to the 17th century stair tower. The extension measures 3.6 metres in length, 2.9 metres in width and, at its highest, 4.1 metres in height. It protrudes 600mm beyond the front elevation of the stair turret. The extension is to be painted brickwork with a clay plain tiled roof. Access from the sitting room will be through an existing doorway. The listed building application also seeks consent for alterations including replacement of beam and strengthening of wall in basement of stair tower, new dwarf wall and steps.
- 2. The application site is a 17th century two storey, Grade II Listed Building, formerly a farmhouse, extended in the 19th century with a service wing to form an L shape. To the rear in the angle between the two ranges is a two storey, 17th century stair turret with a basement below. The dwelling faces partly onto the road with a mature garden to the rear. The original form of the building survives and has not been extended or significantly altered. The construction is a timber frame partly encased in painted 19th century brick with a plain tiled roof. The eastern elevation is relatively unaltered and is timber framed and plastered with some brickwork to the lower part of the stair turret. There are two small windows in the stair turret, one small first floor window and a glazed door to the lounge.

Planning History

- 3. S/0478/04/ F Addition of pitched roof to flat roofed garage Approved
- 4. S/0094/96/LB Alterations, replacement of 2 windows, louvre to cellar and skirting to hallway Approved
- 5. S/1053/94/LB Part demolition, alterations and damp proofing– Approved

Planning Policy

- 6. **Policy P7/6** of the Structure Plan states that development should protect and enhance the quality and distinctiveness of the historic built environment.
- 7. **Policy HG12** of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2004 states that planning permission for the extension of dwellings will not be permitted where:
 - The design and use of materials would not be in keeping with local characteristics;
 - The proposal would seriously harm the amenities of neighbours;
 - There would be an unacceptable loss of off-street parking or garden space within the curtilage;
 - There would be an unacceptable visual impact upon the street scene; or
 - Boundary treatments would provide an unacceptable standard of privacy and visual amenity.
- 8. **Policy EN20** of the Local Plan states that planning permission will be refused where it is required for extensions to Listed Buildings which: (in part)
 - are not necessary to ensure the continuing use of the building;
 - would dominate or detract from the Listed Building in scale, form, massing or appearance;
- 9. Planning Policy Guidance (PPG) 15 "Planning and the Historic Environment" paragraph 3.3 states that " local planning authorities should have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses".

Consultation

- 10. Linton Parish Council recommends approval of both applications.
- 11. **Conservation Manager** recommends the applications be refused, commenting that:

The proposed extension is considered to fail to meet the tests in the Local Plan policy and is inappropriate and detracts from the simple unaltered character of the rear elevation. The addition of a porch and shower room onto the existing stair turret will have a significant impact on the rear elevation of the listed building and compromise its architectural form and historic interest.

12. The building is currently occupied and well maintained and consequently the development is not necessarily justified in terms of ensuring the continued use of the historic building.

Representations

13. The occupier of No.32 Emson's Close has no objections to the development in principle but does express concerns relating to drainage/sewerage.

Planning Comments – Key Issues

14. The key issue is the effect of the extension on the character and appearance of the listed building.

Listed Building

- 15. The existing stair turret is an important feature, which dominates the rear elevation and contributes to the special character and appearance of the listed building. The proposed extension would partly obscure the stair turret and the external wall of the living room and create a separate visual focus, which would compromise the character of the stair turret as a stand-alone structure. The extension would thereby detract from the special character of the rear elevation in scale, form and appearance.
- 16. The listed building application also includes works to the basement to cure a longstanding structural problem and it is suggested that the extension would prevent a similar problem arising in the future, by enclosing the area and preventing damp penetration. These works could be carried out without constructing an extension and are not considered to be sufficient justification for a proposal that would harm the character and appearance of this listed building.
- 17. In addition to the above considerations, it has been noted that the proposal is not required to ensure the continued use of the building, which currently is occupied as a dwelling and remains suited to this purpose.
- 18. The proposal is considered to fail to meet the tests in the Local Plan policy and is inappropriate and detracts from the special character of the listed building. The addition of a porch and shower room will have a significant impact on the rear elevation of the listed building. The result will neither preserve nor enhance its character and appearance.
- 19. The proposed replacement beam, strengthening of wall in basement of stair tower, new dwarf wall and steps are considered to be acceptable.

Other Issues

20. The proposal would not have a serious impact on the amenity of neighbours and is considered to be acceptable in terms of the criteria in Local Plan Policy HG12. Given the scale of the proposed development, the neighbour's concerns in relation to drainage/sewerage are perhaps more appropriately dealt with as part of a Building Regulations application and are not reason to refuse this application. Nor are they reason to attach a condition to any approval requiring the agreement of drainage/sewerage details.

Recommendations

- 19. Refusal
 - The proposed single storey rear extension, by virtue of its form and appearance, is considered to significantly alter the external appearance of the building to its detriment. The proposal is considered to be damaging to its special character, appearance and the historic interest of the building and is therefore contrary to Policy P7/6 of the Cambridgeshire and Peterborough Structure Plan 2003 and Policy EN20(2) of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2004.
 - 2. The building is occupied and well maintained and the proposed extension cannot therefore be justified as being necessary to secure the continued viable use of the historic building. The proposal is, therefore, contrary to Policy EN20(1) of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2004.

Background Papers: the following background papers were used in the preparation of this report:

- a. File Refs: S/1297/04/LB, S/1298/04/F, S/0478/04/ F, S/0094/96/LB and S/1053/94/LB
- b. Cambridgeshire and Peterborough Structure Plan 2003
- c. South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2004
- d. Planning Policy Guidance (PPG) 15 "Planning and the Historic Environment"

Contact Officers: Barbara Clarke – Planning Assistant and Andrew Moffat – Area Planning Officer Telephone: (01954) 713179/713169